

June, 2012



STANDING
COMMITTEE
ON
FOREIGN
AFFAIRS
AND
DEFENCE

SPECIAL REPORT ON PAK-US RELATIONS

Preface

It gives me immense pleasure to put forward this report before the house. Keeping in mind the prevailing political scenario of the country and such incidents which have raged anti-American sentiments in the public, the Standing committee on Foreign affairs and defence decided to make a ***Special Report on PAK US Relations*** using article 90 of the Rules of Procedure of the Youth Parliament Pakistan.

I am thankful to Allah Almighty for giving us the ability to do all what we can. All the members of the committee have dedicated justified time to the committee and have always shown a remarkable attendance in the meetings. I am thankful to Mr. Osama for typing the meeting minutes for me. Mr. Fahad and Miss Sarah have always been responsible in giving their input prior to the commencement of the session and time and again reminding us of meeting duration! Mr. Hammad, Miss Elia and Mr. Umar have contributed to the best of their ability in making of this report.

Mr. Haseeb, Mr. Gulfam and Mr. Atique have persistently added their views in the formulation of this report. Mr. Tabraiz and Mr. Aamir have elevated the performance of the committee and are a good addition to the committee.

In the end, I thank all the members for tolerating me as the Chairperson of the Committee.

MUHAMMAD TAIMOOR SHAH

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----------------|
| PREFACE..... | 02 |
| MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE..... | 04 |
| LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS..... | 05 |
| COMMITTEE MEETING NO 1..... | 06 - 08 |
| COMMITTEE MEETING NO 2..... | 09 |
| COMMITTEE MEETING NO 3..... | 10 - 14 |
| SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS..... | 15 - 16 |
| ANNEXTURE I (PCNS RECOMMENDATIONS)..... | 17 - 21 |
| ANNEXTURE II (BLUE PARTY FOREIGN POLICY)..... | 22 - 24 |
| REFERENCES..... | 25 |

Members of the Committee

- | | |
|--------------------|--------------------------------|
| (1) YP03-BALOCH 01 | Elia Nauroz Ali (Blue) |
| (2) YP11-ICT01 | Muhammad Atique (Blue) |
| (3) YP15-KPK02 | Fahad Mazhar Ali (Green) |
| (4) YP16-KPK03 | Muhammad Hammad Malik (Green) |
| (5) YP19-KPK06 | Sarah Abdul Wadood Khan (Blue) |
| (6) YP26-PUNJAB06 | Gulfam Mustafa (Blue) |
| (7) YP30-PUNJAB10 | Muhammad Aamir Khan (Blue) |
| (8) YP35-PUNJAB15 | Muhammad Taimoor Shah (Green) |
| (9) YP36-PUNJAB16 | Muhammad Umar Riaz (Blue) |
| (10) YP42-PUNJAB22 | Osama Mehmood (Blue) |
| (11) YP51-SINDH03 | Muhammad Haseeb Ahsen (Green) |
| (12) YP58-SINDH10 | Tabraiz Sadiq Marri (Green) |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|-------------|---|
| NATO | North Atlantic Treaty Organization |
| MoU | Memorandum of Understanding |
| PCNS | Parliamentary Committee on National Security |
| ISAF | International Security Assistance Force |
| SCO | Shanghai Cooperation Organization |
| NPT | Non-Proliferation Treaty |
| UN | United Nations |

COMMITTEE MEETING NO 1

Business of the committee was...

- Discussion on the policy matters related to PAK-US Relations and the major incidents in recent days.
- Discussion on prevailing political scenario and public sentiments regarding United States of America
- Allocation of task to various members of the committee and listening to their point view regarding the scheme of work.

Agenda 1

Breach of Pakistan's sovereignty and territorial integrity.

The members of the committee unanimously agreed that incidents such as Abbottabad and Salala, which breach the sovereignty and territorial boundaries of Pakistan should be condemned and all such violations should be dealt with military counter attack and voice should be raised against such events in the united nation. Furthermore, United States of America should seek an unconditional apology from Pakistan on attacking the military check posts in Salala.

Agenda 2

Drone attacks and the collateral damage caused.

The committee agreed upon that, Drone attacks be it unilateral or bilateral should be halted with immediate effect and conflicts with the militants should be resolved through negotiations and local jirga's should be endorsed to maintain peace and harmony. The drone attacks, be it unilateral or bilateral, cause collateral damage and rage anti-army and anti-American sentiment in the people, consequently maintenance of peace is hampered.

Agenda 3

NATO Supplies.

The member were united upon the opinion that NATO Supplies, except for arms and ammunitions, should continue subject to payment of heavy levies for the development of infrastructure used and that the Supplies should be screened before transportation.

Agenda 4

American foot prints in Pakistan

All the members of the committee supported the opinion that the visa policy regarding America should be strictly monitored and that scrutiny of the civil military American officials is comprehensive. Furthermore, no military bases should be in possession of US officials for any purpose. Outsourcing of security of the embassies should not be given to foreign security agencies like black waters. No American boots on Pakistan soil shall be tolerable, come what may.

Agenda 5

Confidential and verbal MoU'S signed between both countries.

The foreign affairs and defence committee agreed that all the confidential and verbal agreements or MoU's signed by previous Governments should stand null and void with immediate effect and that all such agreements should be presented before national assembly for review. The agreements or MoU's signed by the armed forces of Pakistan should be categorically dealt with afore mentioned action against such deals.

Agenda 6

Relation based on mutual interest.

The members of the committee were united upon the opinion that PAK US Relations should be based on mutual interests and respect. The United States of America should honor the sovereignty and territorial integrity of Pakistan. The culture of “Trade not Aid” should be promoted.

The United States of America should pave way for Pakistan’s access to European markets.

COMMITTEE MEETING NO 2

Business of the committee was...

- Discussion on future terms of engagements with the United States of America.
- Discussion on Pakistan's interests and US influence on decision making.

Agenda 1

US-Afghan Policy and Pakistan's Stake

The committee unanimously agreed that the future of Afghanistan should be determined by the Afghans themselves and the policy should be afghan-led and afghan-owned. Moreover, the committee agreed upon that there is no military solution to Afghanistan and that the dialogue is the only way forward. In continuation of this the members unanimously supported the opinion that the US and NATO forces should evacuate Afghanistan as soon as possible and initiate a dialogue process with the Taliban and acknowledging Pakistan as a strong determinant of stability in Afghanistan. Along with this committee agreed that Pakistan should promote pro-Afghanistan policy and increase ties with Afghanistan in every aspect ranging from trade to military. The committee agreed that the US should deprive the influence of India in Afghanistan which proposes a threat to Pakistan's national security.

Agenda 2

Iran-Pakistan gas pipeline project

The committee agreed that Iran-Pakistan Gas Pipeline should be actively pursued regardless of International pressure.

COMMITTEE MEETING NO 3

Business of the committee was...

- Assessment of all the recommendations of the Parliamentary Committee on National Security PCNS. (Annexure I)
- Discussion on Government's Foreign Policy Stance towards relations with the United States of America. (Annexure II)
- Recommendations of the Committee.
- Finalizing the "Special Report on PAK-US Relations"

Agenda 1

Explanation of the Summary of Foreign Policy of the Government by the Minister-in-charge.

- Drone strikes carried out by foreign forces should be completely halted as they are against sovereignty of Pakistan and an open breach of International Laws.
- Normal duty will be applied to the NATO Supplies; NATO Supplies should be opened only when Pakistan gets assurance of a reasonable proportion of contracts to manufacture goods transiting through Pakistan.
- Pakistan encourages stability in Afghanistan.
- Pakistan should pursue Permanent membership of the Shanghai Corporation Organization with progressive proceedings towards achievement of such a status which favors Pakistan for its membership.

Agenda 2

Question Answer session with ministry-in-charge of the ministry of Foreign Affairs and Defence.

Q:-1 “There should be complete cessation of drone strikes in Pakistan”- this statement is mentioned in your foreign policy statement, what is your stance regarding Drone strikes if conducted with mutual agreement or by Pakistan armed forces?

Ans: - Drone Strikes conducted by foreign forces shall not be tolerated but if Drone Technology is shared with Pakistan, Drone strikes shall be considered legal in the eye of International Law.

Q:-2 “Normal duties will be applied to this transit”- this statement is mentioned in your foreign policy statement, what do you mean by “Normal duties” and “Transit”?

Ans: - “Transit” means NATO Supplies; “Normal duties” mean that the no special rates shall be applicable to the NATO Supplies.

Q:-3 *Do you believe that NATO Supplies should be opened immediately and what is your point of view on transporting NATO supplies using Pakistan Air Space?*

Ans: - *Yes, the NATO supplies should be opened with immediate effect and both the routes should be used simultaneously provided that the infrastructure deteriorated by the NATO Supplies should be developed.*

Q:-4 *How Pakistan should seek permanent membership of the Shanghai Corporation Organization?*

Ans: - *Pakistan should first strive to fulfill the criteria for becoming a permanent member of the SCO then pursue for its membership. The United States should favor Pakistan's membership for SCO.*

Q:-5 *what is your policy regarding the Afghan conflict?*

Ans: - *The Afghan conflict should be resolved via dialogue and that the NATO and ISAF forces should evacuate Afghanistan after stabilizing it and that immediate withdrawal of forces would not be suitable.*

The security across the Durand Line should be strengthened and that both Pakistan and America should take measures to stop cross border terrorism across the Durand Line.

Q:-6 what do you mean by the statement “We support nuclear nonproliferation but this project is in best interest of Pakistan due to prevailing energy crisis. Pakistan can reconsider this project if U.S. accepts our demand for a civil nuclear program to address energy crisis of Pakistan.”

Ans:- Pakistan should actively pursue the Iran Pakistan Gas pipeline Project because this project would resolve the prevailing energy crises in Pakistan but if the United States of America signs a deal of civil-nuclear technology with Pakistan, we can step down this Iran Pakistan Gas pipeline Project. Foreign relations are on give and take basis. At the same time we support the NPT and endorse the treatment done with Iran in this regard as we cannot go against the entire world regarding this issue.

Q:-7 what role should the United States Play in resolving the Kashmir dispute?

Ans: - Kashmir is a dispute between Pakistan and India. Pakistan should not look towards the United States to directly influence the dialogue though back door diplomacy should be used to resolve the dispute according to the UN resolution.

Q:-8 what role should the United States Play in resolving the Water dispute?

Ans: - Similarly the water dispute is a dispute between Pakistan and India. The United States has no role to play in the water dispute between the two countries. The water dispute should be resolved in the eye of the Indus Water treaty signed between both the countries.

Summary of the Committee's Recommendations:-

- 1) Incidents which breach the sovereignty and territorial boundaries of Pakistan should be condemned and dealt with military counter attack and voice should be raised against such events in the united nation.
 - (a) America should seek an unconditional apology from Pakistan on attacking the military check posts in Salala.

- 2) Drone attacks be it unilateral or bilateral should be halted with immediate effect and conflicts with the militants should be resolved through negotiations.

- 3) NATO Supplies, except for arms and ammunitions, should continue, subject to the
 - (a) Approval of the parliament
 - (b) Payment of heavy levies,
 - (c) Screening of the supplies.

- 4) Visa policy regarding America should be strictly monitored.
 - (a) No military bases should be in possession of US.
 - (b) No foreign security agencies like black waters should be allowed to operate in Pakistan.
 - (c) No American boots on Pakistan soil shall be allowed.

- 5) All the Confidential and verbal MOU'S signed between both the countries should stand null and void with immediate effect.

- 6) The NATO and ISAF forces should evacuate Afghanistan as soon as possible and
 - (a) Promote Dialogue with the Taliban
 - (b) Acknowledge Pakistan as a strong determinant of stability in Afghanistan.
 - (c) Afghan policy should be afghan-led and afghan-owned

- 7) The Iran Pakistan Gas pipeline project should be actively pursued by Pakistan, despite of external opposition and no reconsideration can be made regarding this project.

ANNEXTURE I

(PCNS RECOMMENDATIONS)

GUIDELINES FOR REVISED TERMS OF ENGAGEMENT WITH USA/NATO/ISAF AND GENERAL FOREIGN POLICY

1. Pakistan's sovereignty shall not be compromised. The gap between assertion and facts on the ground needs to be qualitatively bridged through effective steps. The relationship with USA should be based on mutual respect for the sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity of each other.
2. The Government needs to ensure that the principles of an independent foreign policy must be grounded in strict adherence to the Principles of Policy as stated in Article 40 of the Constitution of Pakistan, the UN Charter and observance of international law. The US footprint in Pakistan must be reviewed. This means
 - (i) An immediate cessation of drone attacks inside the territorial borders of Pakistan,
 - (ii) the cessation of infiltration into Pakistani territory on any pretext, including hot pursuit;
 - (iii) Pakistani territory including its air space shall not be used for transportation of arms and ammunition to Afghanistan.
3. Pakistan's nuclear program and assets, including its safety and security cannot be compromised. The US-Indo civil nuclear agreement has significantly altered the strategic balance in the region therefore Pakistan should seek from the US and others a similar treatment/facility. The strategic position of Pakistan vis-à-vis India on the subject of FMCT must not be compromised and this principle be kept in view in negotiations on this matter.
4. Pakistan reaffirms its commitment to the elimination of terrorism and combating extremism in pursuance of its national interest.
5. The condemnable and unprovoked NATO/ISAF attack resulting in the martyrdom (*shahadat*) of 24 Pakistani soldiers, represents a breach of international law and constitutes a blatant violation of Pakistan's sovereignty *and* territorial integrity. The Government of Pakistan should seek an unconditional apology from the US for the unprovoked incident dated 25th-26th November, 2011, in Mohmand Agency in addition the following measures be taken;
 - i) Those held responsible for the Mohmand Agency attack should be brought to justice.
 - ii) Pakistan should be given assurances that such attacks or any other acts impinging on Pakistan's sovereignty will not recur.

iii) Ministry of Defence/PAF should formulate new flying rules for areas contiguous to the border.

6. No verbal Agreement regarding national security shall be entered into by the Government, its Ministries, Divisions, Departments, attached Departments, Autonomous Bodies or other Organizations with any foreign Government or Authority. All such agreements or understandings shall cease to have effect forthwith.

7. No overt or covert operations inside Pakistan shall be permitted.

8. That for negotiating or re-negotiating Agreements/MOU's pertaining to or dealing with matters of national security, the following procedure shall be adopted:

i) All Agreements/MOU's, including military cooperation and logistics, will be circulated to the Foreign Ministry and all concerned Ministries, attached or affiliated Organizations and Departments for their views;

ii) All Agreements/MOU's will be vetted by the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs;

iii) All Agreements/MOU's will be circulated to the Parliamentary Committee on National Security. The Committee shall vet and make recommendations in consultation with the stakeholders and forward the same to the Federal Cabinet for approval under the Rules of Business of the Federal Government;

iv) The Minister concerned will make a policy statement on the Agreements/MOU's in both Houses of Parliament.

9. No private security contractors and/or intelligence operatives shall be allowed.

10. Pakistan's territory will not be provided for the establishment of any foreign bases.

11. The international community should recognize Pakistan's colossal human and economic losses and continued suffering due to the war on terror. In the minimum, greater market access of Pakistan's exports to the US, NATO countries and global markets should be actively pursued.

12. In the battle for the hearts and minds an inclusive process based on primacy of dialogue and reconciliation should be adopted. Such process must respect local customs, traditions, values and religious beliefs.

(a) There is no military solution to the Afghan conflict and efforts must be undertaken to promote a genuine national reconciliation in an Afghan-led and Afghan-owned process.

(b) To strengthen security along the Pakistan–Afghanistan border, including the cross border flow of criminal elements, narcotics and weapons, the feasibility of additional measures including electronic surveillance may be evaluated and the process of local joint Jirga’s should be encouraged according to local customs and traditions.

13. That Pakistani territory shall not be used for any kind of attacks on other countries and all foreign fighters, if found, shall be expelled from our soil. Likewise, Pakistan does not expect the soil of other countries to be used against it.

14. The Government needs to review the present focus of foreign policy keeping in view the aspirations of the people of Pakistan. It needs to establish a balance by emphasizing links with our traditional allies and building new relationships for diversifying the sources of economic, military and political support. In this regard it may take the following amongst other steps:

i) Pakistan’s foreign policy must continue to focus on creating a peaceful environment in the region to pursue the goals of economic development and social progress;

ii) the dialogue process with India should be continued in a purposeful and result-oriented manner on the basis of mutual respect and mutual interest, including efforts for the solution of the Jammu & Kashmir dispute in accordance with the UN Resolutions;

iii) special attention must continue to be paid to developing close cooperative relations with neighbouring countries;

iv) the strategic partnership with China must be deepened in all its dimensions;

v) the relationship with the European Union should be strengthened and enhanced in all spheres;

vi) relationship with the Russian Federation should be further strengthened;

vii) Pakistan's support for the promotion of peace and stability in Afghanistan remains the cornerstone of its foreign policy;

viii) Pakistan's special relationship with the Islamic world should be reinforced;

ix) Pakistan's full membership of SCO should be actively pursued;

x) Pakistan's bilateral relationships in the region and its institutional partnership with ASEAN and GCC countries must be upgraded and strengthened; and

xi) Pakistan should actively pursue the gas pipeline projects with Iran and Turkmenistan.

ANNEXTURE II

(BLUE PARTY FOREIGN POLICY)

Summary of Policy

Pak-US Ties

Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Defense incorporates realism and pragmatism as the main dictating factor of its policy keeping in consideration the history of relations with U.S., mutual importance of both parties, national and international interests, current regional and global scenario and Parliamentary Committee on National Security's (PCNS) guidelines for the revision of relations with U.S. and allied forces.

Ministry at Youth Parliament assumes progressive approach in its foreign policy by intention of using **maximum benefit out of common interest areas for both parties along with creation/identification of more areas of common interests without any compromise over national integrity of a sovereign state of Pakistan.** Pakistan enjoys sovereignty endowed by International laws. Pakistan expects from civilized world to respect international laws.

Government Policy extends the guidelines for revised terms of engagement with U.S. and allied forces recommended by PCNS with modifications as stated below:

1. (Addition to 1st article) Effective Steps should be identified mutually so that no room is left for any event adding to mistrust and hostility between both parties.
2. Addition to clause (i) Pakistan has shown his commitment towards war against terrorism which costs her suffering of thousands of precious lives and capital. It is time to understand Pakistan's concerns as Pakistan already understands the concerns of U.S. It is demanded from U.S. that as the cause is same then why should we move divided in a mistrust which would create nonproductive situation and loss of civilian lives. **Drone strikes, carried out by foreign forces, are against sovereignty of Pakistan as an open breach of International Laws and**

constitutes a blatant violation of Pakistan's sovereignty and territorial integrity. There should be complete cessation of drone strikes in Pakistan.

3. (Addition to 11th article) It may be asked to build road infrastructure or railroad infrastructure with supply of engines included from Gawader to Afghanistan for transit business. **Normal duty will be applied to this transit.** Supply routes should not get opened unless Pakistan gets assurance of a reasonable proportion of contracts to manufacture goods transiting through Pakistan.
4. [Addition to article 13th clause (a)] Pakistan encourages stability in his western neighborhood.
5. [Addition to article 16th and clause (viii)] with a progressive proceedings towards achievement of such a status which favors Pakistan for its membership.
6. [Addition to article 16th and clause (x)] which would compensate Pakistan in its current energy crisis to some extent. **We support nuclear nonproliferation but this project is in best interest of Pakistan due to prevailing energy crisis.** Other proposed alternative i.e. Tajik-Afghan-Pak pipeline project does not appear feasible in near future. **Pakistan can reconsider this project if U.S. accepts our demand for a civil nuclear program to address energy crisis of Pakistan.**
7. [Insertion of a new clause under article 16 as clause (xi)] As Foreign policy of Pakistan considers economy as one of the main determinants of its policy, all departments of state specifically foreign secretariat should spend energies to reap maximum trade opportunities for stable economic growth. It is firmly believed that:

*'Our oft-quoted strategic location is strategic only
if commerce flows through it in all directions.*

'(Qadir)

REFERENCES

www.senate.gov.pk/reports/Communication/February07V3.pdf

<http://www.youthparliament.pk>

<http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1334243269639.pdf>