

State of
ELECTORAL REFORMS
in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

State of
ELECTORAL REFORMS
in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2013

ISBN: 978-969-558-300-5

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT

Supported by



Published by



Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency - PILDAT

Islamabad Office: No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad, Pakistan

Tel: (+92-51) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-51) 226 3078

Lahore Office: 45-A, Sector XX, 2nd Floor, Phase III Commercial Area, DHA, Lahore, Pakistan

Tel: (+92-42) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-42) 3569 3896

E-mail: info@pildat.org; Web: www.pildat.org

CONTENTS

Foreword

Analysis of the Package of Amendments to the Representation of the People Act, 1976 (LXXXV of 1976) proposed by the Election Commission of Pakistan 07

1. Amendments meant to further empower the ECP 07
2. Amendments aimed at increasing the amounts of fines for certain offences 08
3. Amendments meant to further empower the District Returning Officers (DROs) and Returning Officers (ROs) 08
4. Amendments proposing increase in the Amounts of Deposits by the candidates for the membership of National and Provincial Assemblies and increasing the threshold of votes at which the forfeiture of deposit can be avoided 08
5. Amendments meant to provide legal cover to the appointment of election monitors by the ECP 09
6. Amendment aimed at increasing the period of scrutiny of nomination papers filed by candidates 09
7. Amendment meant to make the violation of Code of Conduct a punishable offence 09

Key Developments with the Potential to Impact upcoming General Election 11

1. Questions raised on the credibility of the Election Commission 11
2. Date of Election 12
3. ECP Ban on new jobs and re-allocation of Development Funds ahead of Election 12
4. Compliance with Supreme Court Directives 12
5. Verification of Voters in Karachi 13

Analysis on the Goals Progressed during October to December 2012 15

An Overview of the Progress on the Implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan 17

Appendices

- Appendix A: Breakdown of ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives 21
- Appendix B: Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan 22
- Appendix C: Objectives-wise Progress on Implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan 23

Foreword

PILDAT Report State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan: Monthly Report: January 2013 has been prepared to present analysis of the Package of Amendments to the Representation of the People Act, 1976 (LXXXV of 1976) as proposed by the Election Commission of Pakistan. The Report also carries PILDAT analysis of the Key Developments with the potential to Impact upcoming General Election.

PILDAT has been monitoring the implementation of Election Commission of Pakistan's 5 Year Strategic Plan on a quarterly basis since October 2011. However, as the country faces the upcoming 10th General Election in 2013, it is felt that a monthly analysis and review of progress on Electoral Reforms as well as electoral processes leading up to the 10th General Election may be a more timely and efficient manner of providing citizens' review on these issues.

The report carries progress review of Election Commission of Pakistan's 5 Year Strategic Plan as on December 31, 2012. The ECP 5 Year Strategic Plan outlines some of the reform initiatives that are planned by the ECP. While the ECP has the responsibility to implement the 5-year strategic plan, it is the responsibility of the citizens to monitor the progress of implementation and raise questions where the progress is slow or stalled. PILDAT's effort in the form of citizens' monitoring is not an effort in finger-pointing and instead it is designed to be helpful to the ECP in overcoming obstacles in the way of timely implementation of its 5-Year Strategic Plan.

Acknowledgments

We wish to thank the ECP for providing us the information requested by us regarding the progress on the Strategic Plan and for sparing time to discuss the progress on various objectives of the Strategic Plan.

We also wish to thank the members of the PILDAT Citizens Group on Electoral Process (CGEP) for their valuable input, support and expert analysis.

This report is prepared by PILDAT under the project *Supporting Monitoring of Democracy, Electoral Reforms and Development of Youth in Pakistan* which is supported by the **Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), Government of Denmark**. We wish to thank for their support.

Disclaimer

The views expressed in this report are those of PILDAT and do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, the Government of Denmark and the Royal Danish Embassy Islamabad. PILDAT team of researchers has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of the data and analysis contained in this report and any omission or error is not deliberate.

Islamabad
February 2013

Analysis of the Package of Amendments to the Representation of the People Act, 1976 (LXXXV of 1976) proposed by the Election Commission of Pakistan

The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) prepared a package of amendments to the Representation of the People Act, 1976 (LXXXV of 1976) and forwarded it to the Federal Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs on January 23, 2013 for further processing through the Cabinet and the Parliament. The package consists of 24 amendments.

The Representation of the People Act is probably the most important and comprehensive law among the election-related laws of Pakistan. The Act comprises 119 Sections. The proposed package of amendments seeks to amend 31 sections, omit two (2) and insert three (3) new sections in the Act.

Some of the proposed amendments are purely procedural and technical with no substantive impact. Some of such proposed amendments seek to refine the language of the law. The remaining proposed amendments can be categorized as follows:

1. Amendments meant to further empower the ECP
2. Amendments aimed at increasing the amounts of fines for certain offences
3. Amendments meant to further empower the District Returning Officers (DROs) and Returning Officers (ROs)
4. Amendments proposing increase in the Amounts of Deposits by the candidates for the membership of National and Provincial Assemblies and increasing the threshold of votes at which the forfeiture of deposit can be avoided
5. Amendments to provide legal cover to the appointment of election monitors by the ECP
6. Amendment aimed at increasing the period of scrutiny of nomination papers filed by candidates
7. Amendment meant to make the violation of Code of Conduct a punishable offense

Out of the above categories of the proposed amendments, the last three (from 5 to 7) are probably the most substantive.

Apparently there seems to be a broad consensus in the society about most of the above proposed amendments except for the category 4 above which may be termed as working against the candidates of modest means. The important question, however, is whether the National Assembly will be able to pass these amendments before it completes its term on March 16, 2013 and what will be final shape of these amendments after these are passed by the National Assembly and the Senate.

Following is a relatively more detailed analysis of the above categories of the proposed amendments:

1. Amendments meant to further empower the ECP

Under this category of amendments, Section 7 of the Act is proposed to be amended to give powers to the ECP *'to suspend or withdraw any officer performing any duty in connection with the election.'* Under the law, if amended, the ECP *'shall be competent to initiate and finalise disciplinary action and impose any penalty against any official for an act of misconduct.....'*

This is one of the powers long demanded by the ECP. It is a welcome proposal and it is hoped that the Parliament will be able to pass the proposed amendment despite the fact that there is a considerable resentment among the Parliamentarians especially from the ruling-coalition against the ban imposed by the ECP recently against the new recruitments and transfer of development funds from one scheme to the other in the constituencies of ministers and the Prime Minister. This resentment may prompt them to take a position against more powers for the ECP but there is a strong societal support behind a strong ECP and it will be difficult to turn down this proposal from the ECP.

It is also proposed to amend Section 14 (Scrutiny), sub-section 5 of the act. Under this sub-section, the ECP could appoint Election Tribunals only after the approval of the President of Pakistan. It had been long argued that subjecting ECP decisions to the approval by the President undermines ECP's independence. It is, therefore, a welcome proposal to change the provision and now, after the proposed amendment is passed, the ECP will nominate 2 to 3 Judges of the High Court as

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

Tribunal in consultation with the concerned Chief Justice of the High Court.

The ECP has also proposed to insert a new section 86C *Power to transfer any person in the service of Pakistan* which, if passed by the Parliament, will empower the ECP to direct the appropriate authority to transfer any person in the service of Pakistan, if such transfer, in its opinion, is necessary for the conduct of free, fair and honest election.

This amendment will also enhance the ECP powers and hopefully will be passed by the Parliament.

2. Amendments aimed at increasing the amounts of fines for certain offences

Sections 80A, 82, 82A, 83(2), 83A(5), 84(2), 85, 86, 87(1)(2), 89, 90, 91 and 92 are proposed to be amended to increase the amount of fines for various offences to Rs. 50,000 and Rs. 100,000. Presently these fines range from Rs. 5000 upwards.

It is expected that these increases will not be contested although there may be a case for increasing the amounts further to deter offenders. Due to inflation, the amounts of fines at present are ridiculously low and do not deter any offender.

3. Amendments meant to further empower the District Returning Officers (DROs) and Returning Officers (ROs)

Section 8 of the Act is proposed to be amended. The amended law will give greater role to the Returning Officers and District Returning Officers in the selection and verification of the location of Polling Stations although the draft list of the Polling Stations in a constituency will now be initiated by the ECP.

Section 14 of the Act is also proposed to be amended which will further strengthen the provision that the Returning Officer can ask any person or agency or authority to provide documents, record or information regarding the scrutiny of nomination papers of a candidate. This provision was already there but now this information is to be provided to the Returning Officers *'within the time specified by the Returning Officer.'*

Section 83A is also proposed to be amended and as per the amended section *The District Returning Officer and the Returning Officer shall be responsible for the effective implantation of the provisions...* relating to the fixing/pasting of posters, etc., of sizes larger than allowed by the law. Presently this authority is with the district nazim or district administration.

Section 96 of the Act is also proposed to be amended which will give the powers to the Returning Officers to launch appropriate proceedings in the court of Magistrate First Class against a person who contravened the provisions of Section 49 (Restrictions on Election Expenses) and failed to comply with Section 50 (Return of Election Expenses). Presently this power is with the ECP.

It is highly unlikely that anyone will oppose these proposed amendments.

4. Amendments proposing increase in the Amounts of Deposits by the candidates for the membership of National and Provincial Assemblies and increasing the threshold of votes at which the forfeiture of deposit can be avoided.

Presently a candidate for the membership of the National Assembly and Provincial Assembly has to deposit a refundable amount of Rs. 4000 and Rs. 2000 respectively at the time of filing the nomination papers. Under the proposed amendment to Section 13 of the Act, this amount is proposed to be increased to Rs. 50,000 and Rs. 25,000 respectively.

Although the amounts of deposit are still not very high but there is at least some merit in the argument that this increase will further discourage a person of modest means to contest election. It is likely that the proposed amount of deposit is reduced by the Parliament.

At present, the deposit is forfeited by the State if a candidate fails to secure 1/8th of the votes polled. It is proposed to

increase this threshold to 1/4th of the total votes polled.

The proposed amendment is probably meant to discourage non-serious contenders but 1/8th was an appropriate threshold for this purpose and may stay unchanged.

5. Amendments meant to provide legal cover to the appointment of election monitors by the ECP

During some of the recent by-elections, the ECP started deploying teams of its own monitors equipped with cameras and video cameras to record evidence and monitor compliance of laws prescribing restrictions on election spending.

This practice has been successfully employed by the Indian Election Commission for the last many years. The ECP has now proposed to insert a new section 104B *Monitoring of Election Campaign, etc to the Act*.

This is a very welcome proposal and will go a long way in ensuring compliance of the Election Laws especially the ones relating to restrictions on Election Expenses and Sizes of Posters, etc., and the compliance of the Code of Conduct.

6. Amendment aimed at increasing the period of scrutiny of nomination papers filed by candidates

The ECP has proposed to amend Section 11 of the Act to increase the period of scrutiny of papers from the present seven (7) days to thirty (30) days.

This is a major amendment which will increase the entire election cycle from announcement of the election date to the holding of polls. Presently this cycle spans around 50 days which will now increase to about 70 days.

There are mixed views on the proposed amendment. Some hold that a longer scrutiny period will encourage witch-hunting of candidates and there will be a lot of mud-slinging. However, apparently there seems to be an overwhelming support for anything that supports greater scrutiny of candidates.

Recent understanding reached between the ruling coalition at the Federal level and Dr. Tahir-ul-Qadri in the form of Islamabad Declaration signed on January 17, 2013 also commits the Government to increase the period of scrutiny from 7 to 30 days.

It is, however, important to underscore that unless the contents of the nomination papers are made accessible to the voters, the longer period of scrutiny will not make much difference. It is therefore very important that the ECP ensures that all nomination papers are put on ECP website as soon as these papers are filed. This is a long standing demand by PILDAT but the ECP, for unknown reasons, has been reluctant to use its website for the purpose of making these important documents accessible to citizens.

The present procedure to obtain a photocopy of nomination papers from Returning Officer concerned is too complicated and time consuming and undermines the very spirit of making these nomination papers and accompanying declarations public.

7. Amendment meant to make the violation of Code of Conduct a punishable offence

The ECP has proposed to insert a new section 86B (Violation of the Code of Conduct) to the Act. According to this amendment '*any person who violates any provision of the code of conduct shall be punishable with fine which may extend to one hundred thousand rupees.*'

This is a substantive amendment which will make violation of Code of Conduct punishable. This indirectly will allow the ECP the legislative powers as Code of Conduct is framed by the ECP. Without any penalty for violation of Code of Conduct, the enforcement of the Code is not possible.

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

It is, however, a subject worth examining whether Code of Conduct should be passed by the Parliament or left to the ECP to frame.

In general, the proposed package of amendments is a very welcome step. Its contents can be further examined in more detail and improved when the bill comes up before the Parliament for debate and passage.

Key Developments with the Potential to Impact Upcoming General Election

Following is PILDAT's analysis of some of the major issues and developments that have the potential to impact the upcoming 10th General Election in Pakistan, due in 2013:

1. Questions raised on the credibility of the Election Commission

The current Election Commission consisting of four (4) members each representing a province and the Chief Election Commissioner (CEC) as its Chairman is the first full-time Election Commission of Pakistan whose members and the CEC are appointed through a bi-partisan process as laid down in the constitution after the 18th Constitutional Amendment.

Most of the political parties, civil society in general and the media hailed the appointment of Justice (Retd.) Fakhruddin G. Ebrahim as the CEC as he enjoyed a reputation of high integrity. No objection was raised on the credentials of the other four members as well.

Lately, however, questions have been raised by a number of political parties and leaders about the credibility of the ECP. Dr. Tahir ul Qadri, who organized a large public meeting in Lahore on December 23, 2012 and later led a 'Long March' of his followers from Lahore to Islamabad demanded drastic electoral reforms including the dissolution of the present Election Commission. He raised the question of advanced age of the CEC and termed the bi-partisan appointment of other four members as a 'Muk Muka' or deal between the two major parties.

A noted and senior lawyer Senator S. M. Zafar thought that the appointment of the Chief Election Commissioner and the four members has not been strictly in accordance with Article 213 (2A) of the Constitution which required that three names be forwarded to the Parliamentary Committee for each position and the Committee would then pick one name after holding hearing. The requirement of three names was met in the case of CEC as both the Leader of the House and the Leader of the Opposition forwarded three names each to the Parliamentary Committee as they could not agree on one set of three names. However, there is no record of proposing three names for each of the four members of the Election Commission. Hearing, on the other hand, was not held for any of the five positions. Senator S. M. Zafar, therefore, maintains that the requirements of the Constitution were not followed in the appointment of the CEC and the four members and the Election Commission is, therefore, not properly constituted and hence void ab-initio.

This is the position which was later adopted by Dr. Tahir ul Qadri though he seems willing to not question the appointment of the CEC. He stated the intention of approaching the superior courts to get a judicial verdict on the question. PML-Q leaders Senator Chaudhry Shujaat Hussain and Chaudhry Pervez Elahi, MNA have also raised questions on the credibility of the four members. Mr. Imran Khan, Chairman Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf has also questioned the integrity of ECP below the CEC level. Jama'at-e-Islami has also leveled serious charges against the CEC and the ECP in general after the CEC gave opinion that delimitation of constituencies in Karachi is not possible unless fresh census is held. The MQM had demanded the resignation of the ECP Secretary when he took a position that delimitation of constituencies in Karachi is possible and will be carried out even without a fresh census. All political parties in Karachi except MQM and PPP had been agitating and holding Sit-ins in front of the ECP Karachi Office because they feel that the re-verification of voters in Karachi is not being carried out independent of the influence and interference of some local groups.

This sudden outbreak of objections on the ECP is not conducive for a Free and Fair Election which is due within the next four months. Except for the objections raised on the constitutionality of the formation of the ECP, there seems to be no solid ground for questioning the credibility of the ECP.

As far as the questions about the formation of the ECP are concerned, these appear to be relating to the letter and not so much about the spirit of the Constitutional provisions.

However, now that a question has been raised and there has certainly been a lapse on the part of the Parliamentary Committee on the Appointment of the CEC and Members of the ECP, it may not be a bad idea to send a reference to the

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

Supreme Court and seek advice on rectifying the lapse.

This lapse does indicate the serious issues of capacity in the National Assembly secretariat. Now that the Parliament and its committees are undertaking serious business of the State, the staffing policies relating to the Parliament need to be seriously reviewed and issues addressed.

2. Date of Election

The National Assembly will complete its 5-year term on March 16, 2013. The four Provincial Assemblies will complete their respective terms on different dates a few days after the National Assembly completes its term. Provincial Assembly of the Punjab will complete its 5-year term on April 9, 2013. If there is no agreement on a date when the Prime Minister and the four Chief Ministers dissolve their respective Assemblies to hold fresh election within 90 days, the Assemblies will complete their terms on such dates that it may be difficult to hold election to both National and Provincial Assemblies on the same date.

It will be an administrative nightmare to hold election on two separate dates. Indications are that all ruling political parties at the Federation and the four Provinces are in touch with each other to agree on a suitable date to dissolve the Assemblies. In the past these parties have been able to develop consensus on very difficult issues such as the 18th, 19th and 20th Constitutional Amendments, National Finance Commission Award and the appointment of the Chief Election Commissioner. Although the election time promotes more divisive politics, it should still be possible for the two main parties, the PPP and the PML-N to agree on a timetable which does not make the organization of election any more difficult than it already is.

In the worst case of the Leaders of the House in the National Assembly and the Punjab Assembly not agreeing, it may still be possible to hold the elections on the same date if the National Assembly is dissolved a day before it completes its term. This will allow 90 days within which to hold election. Even if the Punjab Assembly is not dissolved earlier and it completes its term on April 9, 2013, and then dissolves automatically for election to be held within 60 days, the two election schedules can be telescoped to hold the election on the same date.

3. ECP Ban on new jobs and re-allocation of Development Funds ahead of Election

In an unprecedented move, the ECP clamped a ban on new recruitment by the Federal and Provincial Governments and on re-allocation of development funds to certain favourite areas and constituencies through a notification on January 21, 2013.

Usually, the ECP does not take such steps until the Election is announced but there were widespread reports that both the Federal and Provincial Governments were doling out jobs to their favourites in huge numbers in order to secure their loyalties during the coming election. This recruitment was not following any rules or merit policy; it was purely based on political considerations. The ECP had received numerous complaints regarding use of government jobs and government funds for influencing the coming election. Furthermore there were reports that development funds were being re-allocated to those constituencies where the Prime Minister, some ministers or other high officials of the party were to contest election so that the voters could be impressed at the State expense.

It is a bold and befitting step by the ECP which will go a long way in establishing the credibility and writ of the ECP. Although the Governments have protested and asked the ECP to reverse its decision, the ECP hopefully stands its ground and provide a level playing field to all political players.

4. Compliance with Supreme Court Directives

The Supreme Court judgment delivered on June 8, 2012 in the Workers Party case contains a number of directions or suggestions regarding the electoral system in Pakistan. The ECP has started complying with many of these directions but

some of these directions carry far-reaching ramifications and relate to basic policy and systems.

It should be for the Parliament to debate and decide whether a Proportional Representation system or a mixed system will be better than the prevailing system. It is also a policy decision and requires legislation if compulsory voting is to be introduced. It is also a policy decision whether we wish to continue with 'First Past The Post System' or we wish to switch to a system which provides for run-off election for the top two contenders if none could secure more than 50 % votes in the first round.

All these systems are in practice in various established democracies and there is no conclusive evidence that one system is better than the other. Each country has adopted systems and policies keeping its peculiar conditions in mind and these have evolved over a period of time.

It will not be appropriate to introduce systemic changes just on the direction of the court.

Honourable courts may decide to desist from issuing such policy directions. They, of course, can draw the attention of the Government and the Parliament towards a particular electoral issue and the Parliament may debate and decide on the possible way outs.

In case the Supreme Court insists that its directions be complied with before the next election, the ECP should approach the Court and argue against this. If required, the ECP should hire an able lawyer to present their case.

5. Verification of Voters in Karachi

The persistent flaws in the Electoral Rolls remains the single most important concern in the context of prospects of free and fair election.

The Election Commission failed to gauge the gravity of situation and order remedial measures when many political parties and citizens complained of massive flaws in the electoral rolls in Karachi. One common complaint was that a large number of voters were not contacted during the first exercise of door-to-door verification. Their preferred place of voting was changed without consulting them and in some cases addresses were assigned to voters which they had never visited and never requested.

Apparently, some foul play was at work and the precarious law and order situation made it extremely difficult for the ECP enumerators to do their work without coercion and interference.

Despite repeated complaints, protest processions and sit-ins, the ECP refused to address the grievances. Finally some political parties took the matter to Supreme Court which ordered fresh exercise of door-to-door verification of voters under the protection of Army and Frontier Corpse (FC) or Rangers. This verification process is underway but the same political parties are protesting that the verification exercise is being carried out without the protection of the Armed Forces which has again rendered the enumerators vulnerable to armed gangs. It is only a few days back that the CEC has asked the military to provide more manpower so that each team is accompanied by the armed forces personnel.

It is extremely important that the Electoral Rolls in Karachi are set right after this elaborate exercise. The ECP should take all possible measures to ensure that the exercise is carried out without intervention of any party. The ECP has no margin of error now. Even the current exercise is scheduled to conclude by March 2013. Any major flaw in the re-verification process can set the whole election cycle back.

The ECP should also worry at this stage about the extra measures it needs to put in place in Karachi to ensure not only free, fair but also peaceful election in Karachi and of course elsewhere such as Balochistan.

Analysis on the Goals Progressed during October to December 2012

During the past three months, PILDAT could see some progress on fourteen (14) of the fifteen (15) goals of the strategic plan.¹ A description and analysis of the progress on these seven Goals is as follows:

Legal Framework

This is Goal #1 of the Strategic Plan. It is estimated that Goal has achieved **47%** progress so far, an increase of 14% since September 30, 2012 when the progress was 33%.

Electoral Rolls

This is the most important goal (Goal # 2) of the Strategic Plan which is: *Improvement in the Registration of Credible, Accurate, Up-to-date and Accessible Electoral Rolls*. According to the ECP progress report on the strategic plan this goal has been **100%** achieved.

Election Operations

Goal # 3 of the Strategic Plan has also seen some progress. It is estimated that the overall progress of the Goal has increased to **55%** as of December 31, 2012 compared to 30% progress on September 30, 2012.

Human Resources Staffing and Compensation

This is Goal # 7 of the Strategic Plan. It is estimated that overall progress goal has advanced to 66% on December 31, 2012 from 50% as on September 30, 2012.

Training, Research & Evaluation

Goal # 9 of the Strategic plan witnessed an increase of **4%** as compared to past Quarter. Its overall progress is estimated to be 67% on December 31, 2012 as compared to 63% on September 30, 2012.

Public Outreach and Interaction

Goal 11 of the Strategic Plan: *Public Outreach and Interaction* also witnessed continuation of the same trend. Overall progress on Goal 11 has increased to **95 %** on December 31, 2012 from 48 % on September 30, 2012.

Political Parties and Candidates

Under Goal 12: *Political Parties and Candidates*, overall progress on this Goal has been assessed to be **36%** as of

December 31, 2012 compared to 29 % on September 30, 2012.

Civic & Voter Education

This is Goal # 13 of the strategic plan. Its progress has been assessed to be **88%** as compared to 76% in September 30, 2012.

Marginalized Groups

Overall progress of this goal is assessed to be **31%**.

Branding

Overall progress on this goal is assessed to be **60%**.

Complaints & Dispute Resolution

The progress on this objective is assessed to be **40%**.

Restructuring the ECP

Overall progress on this Goal is assessed to be **83%** as compared to 45% in the past quarter.

Logistics, Infrastructure, Equipment

This is the 6th Goal of the Strategic Plan. Overall progress on this goal is assessed to be **36%**.

IT

This is the 10th Goal of the strategic plan. Its progress is assessed to be 90% as compared to **48%** in the past quarter.

Overall Progress

Overall progress for all the 15 Goals was assessed to be **76 %** as of December 31, 2012. The progress as of September 30, 2012 is estimated to be 60 %.

1. The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) prepared and unveiled a Five-Year Strategic Plan 2010-2014 on May 25, 2010. Under the Plan, a total of 127 objectives are listed under 15 Strategic Goals with deadline for achieving each objective. Four (4) objectives do not have a specific deadline as these relate to recurrent activities. For details, please see *Appendix A*.

An Overview of the Progress on the Implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan

There are a total of 127 objectives which are to be realized under 15 Strategic Goals of the ECP 5-Year Strategic Plan. Out of these, 4 Objectives do not have any specific deadline as these are continuous or regular or recurrent activities.

Out of the remaining 123 Objectives, 96 objectives were scheduled to be achieved by December 31, 2012. The remaining 27 objectives are scheduled to be achieved after December 31, 2012 - some of them as late as December 2014.

Appendix A: Breakdown of ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives provides all relevant statistical details about how 127 objectives are divided up among the 15 Strategic Goals. *Appendix B: Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan* presents summary of the estimated progress for each Goal.

We have tried to assess the progress for each objective individually. We have discussed the objectives' progress with more than one knowledgeable expert outside PILDAT and where possible we have provided an opportunity to the ECP to give us a feedback on the assessment of the percentage of Progress made by us. We have tried to modify our estimate of percentage progress made on individual objectives in case we received a feedback which warranted this modification. *Appendix C: Objectives-wise progress on implementation of ECP Strategic Plan* presents not only the progress but a brief account of the progress made which formed the basis of the assessment of percentage progress.

As of December 31, 2012, the average progress made on 97 objectives which were scheduled to be completed by December 31, 2012 is assessed to be 55 %, whereas this progress should have been 100 %.

There has been some progress on some of the 27 objectives whose realization is not yet due. The average progress made on 27 objectives is assessed to be **21 %**.

The total progress made on all 123 objectives as of December 31, 2012 is estimated to be **76 %** (55 % + 21 %).

Out of all the Strategic Goals, the greatest progress (100%) seems to have been made on *Goal 2: Registration of Votes and Electoral Rolls*. The second greatest progress is made

on *Strategic Goal 11: Public Outreach* (95 %). The least progress has been made on *Strategic Goal 8: Finance & Budget* where only 28 % progress is estimated.

APPENDICES

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

Appendix A:

Breakdown of ECP Strategic Plan Goals and Objectives

Goal No.	Goal Title	Number of Objectives scheduled to be completed December 31, 2012	Number of Objectives scheduled to be completed AFTER December 31, 2012	Total number of objectives with specific deadline	Number of Objectives without any specific deadline	Total Number of Objectives
1	Legal Framework	3	0	3	1	4
2	Electoral Rolls	11	0	11	1	12
3	Election Operations	15	2	17	2	19
4	Complaints & Disputes Resolution	4	0	4		4
5	Restructuring ECP	7	0	7		7
6	Logistics, Infrastructure, Equipment	8	3	11		11
7	Human Resources	8	3	11		11
8	Finance & Budget	3	1	4		4
9	Training, Research & Evaluation	11	6	17		17
10	IT	7	1	8		8
11	Public Outreach	2	3	5		5
12	Political Parties & Candidates	6	0	6		6
13	Civic & Voter Education	3	7	10		10
14	Marginalised Groups	6	0	6		6
15	Branding	2	1	3		3
	Total	96	27	123	4	127

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

Appendix B:

Goal-wise Progress Summary of ECP Strategic Plan

Goal	Goal Title	Progress made on Objectives scheduled to be completed BY December 31, 2012	Progress made on Objectives scheduled to be completed AFTER December 31, 2012	Total Progress for the Goal as of December 31, 2012	Total Progress for the Goal as of September 30, 2012
1	Legal Framework	47%	0%	47%	33%
2	Electoral Rolls	100%	0%	100%	90%
3	Election Operations	55%	0%	55%	30%
4	Complaints & Disputes Resolution	40%	0%	40%	50%
5	Restructuring ECP	83%	0%	83%	45%
6	Logistics, Infrastructure, Equipment	36%	0%	36%	38%
7	Human Resources	58%	8%	66%	50%
8	Finance & Budget	8%	20%	28%	28%
9	Training, Research & Evaluation	33%	34%	67%	63%
10	IT	80%	10%	90%	49%
11	Public Outreach	30%	65%	95%	48%
12	Political Parties & Candidates	36%	0%	36%	29%
13	Civic & Voter Education	75%	13%	88%	76%
14	Marginalised Groups	31%	0%	31%	12%
15	Branding	30%	30%	60%	35%
Overall Progress for 15 Goals		55	21	76	

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

Appendix C:

Objectives-wise Progress on Implementation of the ECP Strategic Plan

Strategic Goal	Objectives with Deadline by December 31, 2012			Objectives with Deadline after December 31, 2012			Overall Progress as of December 31, 2012
	Number and Title of Objectives	Progress as of September 30, 2012	Progress as of December 31, 2012	Number and Title of Objectives	Progress as of September 30, 2012	Progress as of December 31, 2012	
1: Legal framework	1: Revise legal framework	75%	75%				
	2: Unification of election laws	50%	65%				
	3: Enhance public understanding of election laws through Urdu translation	0%	0%				
Overall Goal Progress		42%	47%		0%	0%	47%
2: Electoral Rolls	1. Improve existing CERS	75%	100%				
	2. Agreement with NADRA	100%	100%				
	3. Pilot project for ECP-NADRA collaboration	100%	100%				
	4. Verify Electoral Rolls with NADRA database	100%	100%				
	5. Legislation on mandatory CNIC	100%	100%				
	6. ECP Infrastructure for maintaining Voters Data	75%	100%				
	7. Study on female enumerators	100%	100%				
	8. Simplify voters registration forms	100%	100%				
	9. Study on picture in electoral roll	100%	100%				
	10. improve display of draft rolls	75%	100%				
	11. extend CERS to all country	100%	100%				
Overall Goal Progress		93%	100%		0%	0%	100%
3: Election Operations	1. Identify new buildings for polling stations	10%	75%	11. publish polling station-wise results on ECP website	0%	0%	
	2. Recruitment & Hiring System for temporary staff	25%	25%	16. Delimit Constituencies for N.A and PA	0	0	
	3. Establish Polling Staff Database	0%	10%				
	4. EVM Study	100%	100%				
	5. Establish permanent polling stations	10%	30%				
	6. Explore CCTV monitoring	0%	100%				
	7. Linkage between polling stations and electoral rolls	10%	50%				
	9. Simplify election related forms	10%	25%				
	12. Review guidelines for polling agents	0%	25%				
	13. Examine postal ballot system	25%	45%				
	17. Review Election symbols	75%	100%				
	14. Booklet for candidates	30%	90%				
	8. Increase number of polling stations	30%	50%				
	10. Efficient Results Management System	10%	75%				
15. Enhance access to Election Observers	30%	30%					
Overall Goal Progress		25%	55%		14%	0%	55%

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

4. Election Complaints & Disputes Resolution	1. Designate officer to deal with Pre-Poll complaints.	0%	0%				
	2. Ensure appropriate legislation for electoral disputes resolution system	50%	50%				
	3. Establish Complaint Management Committees	10%	10%				
	4. Put in place a complaint tracking system	30%	100%				
Overall Goal Progress		20%	40%		30%	0%	40%
5. Restructuring the ECP	1. Develop and approve the re-organization plan	90%	100%				
	2. Organizational restructuring of the ECP	20%	100%				
	3. Establish a Legal Unit headed by a Deputy Secretary.	50%	100%				
	4. Establish a Training, Research and Evaluation Wing.	75%	100%				
	5. Update DG IT to BS 20.	0%	100%				
	6. Establish an Electoral Rolls Unit.	10%	10%				
	7. Strengthen the Federal Election Academy	70%	70%				
Overall Goal Progress		45%	83%		0%	0%	83%
6. Logistics, Infrastructure and Equipment for ECP	1. Conduct a comprehensive need assesment of ECP infrastructure.	50%	50%	2. Construct/Purchase ECP buildings for Field Offices	0%	0%	
	7. Replace/purchase vehicles for District offices	50%	50%	3. Construct Housing for ECP staff	0%	0%	
	8. Purchase Computers, scanners, printers furniture etc	65%	100%	4. Construct ECP warehouses for Election Material	0%	0%	
	10. Review and maintain computer based inventory of Election Supplies.	0%	0%				
	11. Adopt a policy for engaging private vehicles for elections	25%	25%				
	5. Construct building for ECP Federal Election Academy	0%	10%				
	6. Construct additional space for Court Room at ECP Secretariat.	0%	10%				
	9. Develop logistics plan for conducting elections	0%	45%				
Overall Goal Progress		38%	36%		0%	0%	38%

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

7. Human Resources Compensation	1. Develop a comprehensive HR policy	75%	100%	7. Ensure that eligible women have atleast 10% representation in the ECP jobs.	25%	25%	36%
	2. Review and update HR rules.	60%	75%	8. Ensure that eligible persons with disabilities have atleast 2% representation in the ECP jobs	0%	0%	60%
	3. Prepare TOR/Job Descriptions of each position	75%	75%	9. Ensure that eligible minorities have atleast 5 % representation in ECP jobs.	0%	0%	
	4. Establish policy for initial appointment of officers in BPS-17	50%	50%				
	5. Increase pay structures	0%	0%				
	6. Review the existing promotion policy.	30%	30%				
	10. Create a pool of former and serving officers.	30%	30%				
	11. Prepare the ECP officers for the role of DROS, Ros	65%	100%				
Overall Goal Progress		48%	58%		8%	8%	66%
8. Finance and Budget	1. Ensure Complete financial autonomy.	25%	25%	3. Raise funds for the implementation of the ECP strategic Plan.	20%	20%	
	2. Computerized the Budget Wing	0%	0%				
	4. Asses and strengthen the current procurment policy	0%	0%				
Overall Goal Progress		8%	8%		20%	20%	28%
9. Training, Research and Evaluation	1. Stengthen the Federal Election Academy to make ita model training insitution.	65%	65%	2. Build Capacity for all employees through training.	30%	30%	
	4. Develop curricula for various training programmes.	50%	50%	3. Conduct Specific workshops for various officials.	45%	45%	
	5. Conduct BRIDGE Training for ECP officials	50%	50%	6. Conduct Research on contemporary electoral issues	35%	35%	
	9. Develop a pool of resource persons for FEA.	30%	100%	7. Undertake Elecction-related Study Visits	50%	50%	
	14. Specialized IT training	30%	30%	16. Cordinate with Donor agencies.	45%	45%	
	8. Monitor and evaluate all programmesand projects.	30%	30%	17. Cordinate with Training Wing of the Establishment Division.	0%	0%	
	10. Train polling officers.	0%	0%				
	11. Train political party agnts.	0%	0%				
	12. Conduct trainings/breifings for election observers.	0%	0%				
	13. Conduct training of Security Personnel.	0%	0%				
	15. Conduct IT trainings in country-wide offices.	10%	10%				
Overall Goal Progress		45%	33%		23%	34%	67%

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

10. Information Technology	1. Formulate a comprehensive IT policy.	50%	50%	7. Introduce a geographical information system.	10%	10%		
	2. Strengthen the IT infrastructure at ECP.	30%	100%					
	4. Re-Design the ECP web	75%	100%					
	5. Restructuring the IT directorate.	30%	100%					
	6. Establish computerized electoral rolls data centre.	50%	100%					
	8. Develop and Implement comprehensive information security and private policy.	10%	10%					
	3. Extend the ECP Intranet portal facility.	30%	100%					
Overall Goal Progress		39%	80%		10%	10%	90%	
11. Public Outreach and Interaction.	4. Establish a permanent Media Centre at the ECP.	0%	10%	1. Increase the level of Interaction with Political Parties.	80%	80%		
	5. Publish and ECP quarterly newsletter.	20%	50%	2. Hold regular consultations with political parties and civil society organization.	65%	65%		
				3. Develop and implement media outreach policy and strategy.	50%	50%		
Overall Goal Progress		0%	30%		54%	65%	95%	
12. Political Parties and Candidates	1. Reform Legislation on Political finance	70%	70%					
	2. Develop regulations and mechanisms.	35%	35%					
	3. Publish the financial statements of Parliamentarians on ECP Website.	0%	0%					
	4. Strengthen Code of Conduct for parties/candidates.	80%	80%					
	5. Train political party reps & candidates on electoral rolls	0%	0%					
	6. Make changes in statement of assets & liabilities Form	30%	30%					
Overall Goal Progress		36%	36%		0%	0%	36%	
13. Civic and Voter Education.	1. Conduct a baseline survey to determine participation rates of various segments of society	80%	100%					
	2. Develop civic and voter education strategy.	75%	100%	4. Increase the % of voter turnout from 44 to 63 %.	50%	50%		
	3. Implement civic and voter education strategy.	10%	25%	5. Increase the turnout of female voters.	40%	40%		
				6. Increase the turnout of minority voters.	0%	0%		
				7. Increase the turnout of persons with disabilities	0%	0%		
				8. Minimize election violence thru voter education	0%	0%		
				9. Include voter education in schools curricula	0%	0%		
				10. Develop youth-specific awareness campaigns.	0%	0%		
	Overall Goal Progress		78%	75%		13%	13%	88%

State of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Monthly Report: January 2013

14. Marginalized Groups	1. Support legislation on participation of disabled.	0%	0%				
	2. Conduct research on voting participation of disabled	0%	10%				
	4. Conduct research on voting participation of women	20%	100%				
	5. Develop and implement policies to increase electoral participation of women & marginalised groups	15%	15%				
	6. Train ECP officials re participation of disabled voters.	50%	50%				
	3. Develop awareness materials for participation of the marginalised.	0%	10%				
Overall Goal Progress		17%	31%		0%	0%	31%
15. Branding of the ECP.	1. Develop a design for Divisional & District Office Buildings	0%	10%	2. Develop and Launch Media Campaign around the vision & Mission of ECP	30%	30%	
	3. Develop an ECP branding.	10%	50%				10%
Overall Goal Progress		5%	30%		30%	30%	60%
Total Objectives	96		5250%	27		575%	
Overall Progress			55%			21%	75.98%

Recent PILDAT Publications on Electoral Issues

Electoral Issues and Reforms remain one of the most important areas of PILDAT's work. It has over 50 publications on the subject. All PILDAT publications on the issue can be accessed online by visiting www.pildat.org by clicking on *Publications-Elections* (Subject) and *All* (Type). Some of the most recent publications on electoral issues are listed below.

Delimitation of Constituencies and Voters List for Karachi

Position Paper; December 2012

Dual Nationality for Public Representatives

Position Paper: July 2012

The Unfinished Agenda of Electoral Reforms in Pakistan

Policy Brief: July 2012



Islamabad Office: No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad
Tel: (+92-51) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-51) 226-3078
Lahore Office: 45-A, Sector XX, 2nd Floor, Phase III
Commercial Area, DHA, Lahore
Tel: (+92-42) 111 123 345 | Fax: (+92-42) 3569 3896
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Web: www.pildat.org